Regional Workshop on Quality Apprenticeships and Work Experience Measures for School-to-Work Transition

6-7 October 2015
Phnom Penh, Cambodia
Background

Young people in Asia and the Pacific remain among the most vulnerable members of society. Not only do they represent 45% of global youth unemployment; but they are also the first victims of discrimination.

They are groomed for careers that are often unreachable but are not guided as they should be for some of the key opportunities that the future holds. In times of growth, they are the last ones to be hired as often employers prefer more experienced workers; and in times of crisis they are the first ones to be fired because their contracts (when they are fortunate enough to have one) are more precarious.

In the midst of the global economic recovery effort, signs of weakening growth in China, India, Indonesia and other nations are worrisome. With more countries being increasingly confronted with graduate unemployment, education modalities are at stake in the region and the transition phase for young people from education to the labour market is increasingly difficult.

To facilitate the transition from school to decent employment, work based programmes including apprenticeships and internships are crucial. However, these programmes are beneficial as long as they target young people with the intent to have them obtain new skills and are primarily focused on the acquisition of hands-on experience; and for as long as they are actually available. Indeed, many pupils or students do not have the possibility to take part in quality apprenticeships.

There are many instances where young people leave school without the knowledge or foundation required to find and retain a good job.

The absence of work exposure programmes in growing or booming industries can prove costly. The urgency therefore resides in promoting the availability of work exposure mechanisms while ensuring their quality. These can be tremendously helpful to young people but there is mounting evidence that work placements outside formal education are frequently replacing quality employment for young people. Other issues include the lack of clear quality guidelines and the need for more research and labour market monitoring. Furthermore, interns are often not well informed of their social and labour rights, and the way they relate to contractual arrangements, health and safety and social protection.

The ILO seeks to support constituents in their policies and measures to improve—and enhance skills and employability of young people through work-based learning systems which prepare young women and men for decent and productive work.

The following countries will be invited to participate in the Regional Workshop on Quality Apprenticeships and Work Experience Measures to Improve the School-to-Work Transition to be held in Phnom Penh on 6-7 October 2015. The event will be an opportunity to share information, experiences and plans for future involvement toward the provision of quality apprenticeships. These countries to be represented are: Cambodia, China, Fiji, Indonesia and Pakistan.

---

1 Quality apprenticeship - unique form of vocational education and training, combining on-the-job training and school-based learning, for specifically defined competencies and work processes. It is regulated by law and based on an oral or written employment contract with a compensatory payment and standard social protection coverage. A formal assessment and a recognized certification come at the completion of a clearly defined duration.
Objectives

The event drew on globally researched good practices and also on the mutual challenges faced by enterprises and interns, and sought to find solutions for the interest of tripartite constituents willing to engage in quality apprenticeships in their countries.

The workshop helped enhance mutual learning on quality apprenticeships and work experience measures so as to better assist young people in their transitions from school to decent employment.

Moreover, it was the opportunity for participants to:

• Enhance their understanding of the pre-requisites for quality apprenticeships and work experience measures;
• Share country, regional and inter-regional experience on what works on quality apprenticeships and work experience measures;
• Identify key elements that constitute good practice in the development and implementation of quality apprenticeships and work experience measures.

Day One: 6 October 2015

Welcome and Introduction

The inaugural session of this Regional Workshop was presided by H.E. Dr Ith Sam Heng, Cambodia’s Minister of Labour and Vocational Training.

Prior to his speech, Ms Carmela Torres, ILO Senior Skills and Employability Specialist welcomed the honourable guests, distinguished resource persons and participants to the workshop – the first Regional Workshop on this topic held in Phnom Penh. She thanked the Minister for his kind support and his precious time in chairing the inaugural session. The resource persons were from Germany, Peru, Zimbabwe, and the Netherlands. Besides, two youth representatives from Cambodia and Thailand were also invited to share their internship/apprenticeships accordingly.

Ms Torres underlined that young people in the Asia and the Pacific region remain among the most vulnerable members of society. They represent 45% of global youth employment and are three to four times more likely to be unemployed than adults. Among the major challenges facing the youths is unemployment and insufficient job creation as well as the gender gaps at varying extents throughout the region. Finding decent jobs continues to be a considerable challenge.

The Youth employment crisis has significantly placed apprenticeships on the policy agenda. The G20 Leaders in their November 2014 Summit also placed apprenticeship high in their policy agenda and declared that “Employment plans must include investments in apprenticeships, education and training, and incentives for hiring young people..” Thus declaring their strong commitment to reducing youth unemployment.

Mrs Torres informed the objectives of the workshop and wished the participants for productive discussions.

H.E. Dr Ith Sam Heng, Minister, welcomed guests and participants to the country. He underlined the importance given to apprenticeship by the Ministry, as well as key activities related to school-to-work transition and apprenticeship. He also mentioned about Cambodia Qualification Framework which helps
assist people to move more easily between the education and training sectors and between those sectors and labor market, by providing the basic for recognition of prior learning, including credit transfer, experience and current competency.

Ms Del Irani from the Australian Broadcasting Corporation was the moderator for the event. Tripartite participants were from Cambodia, China, Fiji, Indonesia and Pakistan. 15 youth leaders from 15 different youth organisations in Cambodia also attended.

Background, Comparative Analysis of Quality Apprenticeships
by Mr Theo van der Loop, ILO International Consultant

The background paper for this workshop (Quality Apprenticeships: A Comparative Analysis) was presented. The objective of this background paper is to develop a comparative analysis of existing apprenticeships programmes in view to catalyse thoughts and inspire dialogue. The present background paper is focused on what apprenticeships and other work based training programmes exist in the region and beyond.

Mr van der Loop explained the apprenticeship life cycle, definition and potential of quality apprenticeship, and the different frameworks. Differences between apprenticeships and internships were also pointed out. A quality apprenticeship is a complete and comprehensive study in itself whereby one earns a structured wage as well. Internships are typically short-term ways of acquiring work experience often for white-collar & professional careers.

The four building blocks of a quality apprenticeship system: i) social dialogue, ii) role and responsibilities, iii) legal framework, and iv) financing arrangements were spelled out.

Mr van der Loop summarised the ten steps to set up or improve a quality apprenticeship system which include: promote social dialogue and coordination, launch a socialisation campaign, involve small enterprises, take a sector approach, formalise the informal economy, improve the legal framework, incorporate an ‘Integrated Training Approach’, explore shared financial arrangements, pay special attention to gender and disability, and identify risks of rapid expansion.

Good Practices on Internships
by Ms Sophon Chau, youth leader from Cambodia and Mr Suebsit Sarntisart, youth leader from Thailand

Two young leaders/youth representatives from Cambodia (Ms Sophon Chau) and Thailand (Mr Suebsit Sarntisart) were invited to share their hands on experiences in internships during the Workshop, challenges and recommendations. Mr Sarntisart shared his experiences in internship in particular with the private
sector, political party, and university whereas Ms Chau shared her experiences in volunteer work for the local community.

Asia-Pacific Labour Market Update
by Mr Matthieu Cognac, ILO Youth Employment Specialist

Mr Cognac provided updates on the labour market in the region, he referred to the ILO Regional Office for Asia and the Pacific’s newly-published Asia-Pacific Labour Market Updates – October 2015 issue. Overall there is still uncertainty. Job quality remains low. Challenges for young people include qualification mismatch, difficult school-to-work transitions. Although there are jobs available, but not all of them are decent. He highlighted that youth unemployment remains a challenge, with the average percentage of 13 in the region. Countries such as Sri Lanka, Indonesia and those in the Pacific Islands still have high youth unemployment. Mr Cognac further informed the participants of wage trend, high skill employment figure, percentage of qualification mismatch of employed youth, etc.

Apprenticeships and School-to-Work Transition in Cambodia

Supporting Youth in School-to-Work Transition
by Mr Hunleng Hay, Deputy Director General, National Employment Agency

Mr Mr Hunleng Hay started the session with the general information on the country’s population, out of 14.7 million, 2 million are youth (aged from 15-24 years old). 80,980 youth are unemployed. Cambodia labour market faces key challenges such as high drop-out rate of students, school-to-work transition, lack of proper employment, vocational, and career guidance, limited access to employment service, lack of access to skill development, lack of labour market information, weak collaboration between training provider, industry and policy maker, emerging skill mismatch, etc.

Mr Hay informed the floor of roles of the National Employment Agency (NEA) as Public Employment Service (PES). NEA provides both service for employers and service for jobseekers. NEA also supports school-to-work transition (eg pre-employment training, job search assistance, career guidance, career/employment forum, labour market information, volunteer and internship). Some challenges were highlighted such as lack of understanding about importance of volunteering/internship, lack of concrete career planning among youth, first-time jobseekers rather look for paid job, lack of volunteering/internship information, delay of volunteering/internship until graduation, consider pursuing more study as a security for job, low commitment/motivation to perform the tasks, employers do not provide enough opportunity, and study schedule are too tight to do volunteering/internship.

Apprenticeship in Cambodia
by Mr Nen Vuthy, Deputy Director, Directorate General of TVET

Mr Nen Vuthy explained that apprenticeship is prescribed in the labour law, stating that the enterprise employing more than sixty (60) workers must have the number of apprentices equal to one-tenth of the number of workers in service of that enterprise. In case that an enterprise fails to prepare apprenticeship, it is obliged to pay tax every year. Tax is set at one per cent (1%) of annual wages earned by total number of workers of that enterprise. To date, 100-120 enterprises have provided trainings to 5500-6000 apprentices every year on all areas such as agriculture, industry, trade, communication, construction, service. The most prominent sectors are garment and footwear.
Mr Vuthy spelled out some key challenges which include lack of labor inspectors, lack of means and incentives for labor inspectors, limited cooperation among enterprises, establishments, companies as they hide actual number of workers, ineffective enforcement of the law on labor by some enterprises, establishments, companies. Mr Vuthy recommended more awareness raising in particular amongst the employers and investors about labour law. Annual apprenticeship obligations should be implemented. Employers, private sectors should engage in human resource training so that there will be more human resources who have acquired real skills as new technology is developed daily (skill training). Training should be provided to concerned officers so that they can enforce the law correctly.

Apprenticeship Scheme in Germany
by Ms Birgit Thomann, Head of Internationalisation of Vocational Education and Training/ Knowledge Management Department, BIBB - Federal Institute for Vocational Education and Training, Germany

The dual system of VET in Germany was presented. This comprise 70% of VET in company and 30% of VET in vocational school.

Ms Thomann reiterated that the training contract is similar to work contract. At the end of the apprenticeship, there is the examination. The exam board includes representatives from employers, employees and vocational school teachers. At the end the nationally government-recognised dual vet certificate will be given.

Ms Thomann provided information about the Federal Institute for Vocational Education and Training or BIBB. It is the national centre of competence for initial and continuing vocational education and training in Germany. She also gave an example of good practice in Europe ie the European Alliance for Apprenticeship EAFA which brings together governments with other key stakeholders, like businesses, social partners, chambers, VET providers, regions, youth representatives or think tanks. The common goal is to strengthen the quality, supply and image of apprenticeships in Europe.

Apprenticeship Scheme in Africa
by Mr Blessing Gwengwe, Skills Development Specialist, Zimbabwe

Mr Gwengwe presented the paper on the perspectives of apprenticeships in Africa that he had prepared for this workshop. He started with the status of Technical Vocational Skills Development (TVSD) in Africa. The apprenticeships in Africa include both formal apprenticeship (the apprentice is paid according to the gazetted salary/wage and aged above 18 years) and informal apprenticeship (skills transfer from a master craftsperson to a young apprentice who acquires skills by way of observation, imitation and repetition while working with the master craftsperson. The apprentice and master craftsperson conclude a training agreement that is established by the trade association). The informal apprenticeship system in Africa is gradually beginning to attract increasing interest not only for academic research and in professional disciplines but also as an active policy issue. This system has proved to be an enduring and an effective source of skills for much of Africa for its large informal economy.

Mr Gwengwe also gave some other samples of the informal apprenticeships in other African countries. Amongst the conclusions, he highlighted that there is continuous need for more oriented training methodologies of apprenticeship training by improving the training of informal apprentices since they provide the bulk of skills development in Africa.
Role of Workers and Employers Organisations in Developing and Promoting Workplace Learning Schemes, Internships and Apprenticeships: Issues and Challenges including Implementation

This session is a fishbowl exercise, moderated by Ms Del Irani. Workers and Employers representatives were invited to be the main persons to speak and respond to the questions. Mr Razin Agus Toniman from KSPI-Confederation of Indonesian Trade unions was the workers representative, whilst Mr Nesbitt Hazelman from the Fiji Commerce and Employers Federation was the representative from employer side.

The questions touched upon the roles of workers and employers organisation in developing and promoting workplace learning schemes, issues, challenges and implementation. Internship was regarded as low pay and as exploitation.

Apprenticeship, from employers’ perspective, is regarded as opportunity to ensure that these young people have a pathway to employment. Attitude, understanding the working culture and willingness to learn is also important.

Skills mismatch was also discussed. Identifying what is needed and where the skills shortages are, would be important in particular it can become training opportunity.

Apart from employers’ and workers’ roles, government’s roles in internships and apprenticeships were also discussed.

Day Two: 7 October 2015

Apprenticeship Scheme in South America/Peru

by Mr Jorge Castro Léon, Deputy National Director of Servicio Nacional de Adiestramiento en Trabajo Industrial (SENATI), Peru

This session was a skype call with Mr Jorge Castro Léon from SENATI, Peru. Mr Castro Léon told the participants about the origins and background of SENATI. Its role is to train and prepare people for operational jobs for the manufacturing and maintenance industries. Mr Castro Léon reiterated that there is dual training (SENATI – companies). The trainees would go under apprenticeship contract, according to the Apprenticeship Law promoted by SENATI, subscribed by the company, the trainee and SENATI.

Mr Castro Léon highlighted the principal factors of SENATI success which include involvement of employers in management, operational and support processes of vocational training, design of the training offer according to the requirements for specific capacities (competences or skills), of productive activities of the environment, implementation of competency-based education and active learning methodology in real production situations.

Country Presentations

People’s Republic of China

This presentation was done by Mr Chao Ma from China Enterprise Confederation, hence it is mainly the employers’ perspective. He mentioned that college graduates in China has been increasing. In 2015 the number of college reaches 7.49 million. The latest data shows that in 2014 the average employment rate is 96.68%.

Mr Chao Ma mentioned that accordingly to the recent survey to enterprises on internships and apprenticeships, school recommendation becomes the major channel for enterprises’ recruitment of intern or apprentice. He highlighted the enterprises’ opinions on youth employment challenges. He also reiterated the necessity of establishing and developing a powerful social supporting system – ranging from policy formulation to the close cooperation of government, school, enterprise and society. Some success cases were presented eg campus school recruitment, school-enterprise integration, establishing of training schools with vocational technical colleges for orientation training and reserve of talents.

Fiji

Mr Tui Toutou from Fiji Government, representative of Fiji tripartite participants, presented the Fiji experiences in apprenticeship. Challenges on apprenticeship programmes in Fiji were highlighted. Apprenticeship policies are quite rigid which requires review to meet modernised industry demand, industries are no longer employing apprentices. Training and skills development are seen as cost/burden. Lack of awareness being in regards to apprenticeship scheme, unavailable database on apprentice graduates, brain drain, etc.
Number of years of apprenticeships of main trades/sectors are presented. Roles of stakeholders were spelled out (industries/employers, training providers, NTPC, and government). Minimum age for apprenticeship is 18 years, with 6 month probation period according to the legislation. Key stakeholders have to collaborate together to produce quality graduates. The regulating body has to put strategic measures and standards.

Service providers should provide qualified and experienced trainers to facilitate the quality teaching and learning strategy per apprentice program. The industries provide quality training work processes and procedures, guidance and professional development. Employers are to provide improved remuneration for the apprentices.

**Indonesia**

Ms Justi Amaria from Indonesia’s Ministry of Manpower presented the apprenticeship programme in Indonesia, on behalf of the Indonesian tripartite participants. She stated that in Indonesia, youth unemployment rate is almost the highest in ASEAN (20 per cent). In this connection, the government considers the quality employment a matter of priority in Indonesia’s National Medium Term Development Plan 2015-2019.

Companies are obliged to have apprenticeship. Agreement with apprentices have to be made which comprise rights & obligations of apprentices, rights & obligation of companies that implement apprenticeship programme, and type of program and skills. Stakeholders involved in apprenticeship programmes were mentioned.

The presentation was complemented by Mr Bob Azam from APINDO – Employers Association of Indonesia. Mr Azam shared experiences on internship programme implementation by Toyota Motor Manufacturing Indonesia.

**Pakistan**

Mr Saeed Ahmad, Director Labour Baluchistan, presented the apprenticeship system in Pakistan on behalf of the country tripartite delegates. The apprenticeship in Pakistan is applicable to all industrial undertakings employing 50 or more with minimum five workers in apprentice-able trades. In Pakistan, youth aged 15-20 can be in the apprenticeship scheme. Age can be extended by the Competent Authority for some of the trades.

His presentation included apprenticeship contract, training module of apprentices, stipend and working conditions, etc. He also pointed out the SWOT analysis of the apprenticeship in the country.

The country delegates recommended bipartite engagement in apprenticeships (employer-trade union), updating legislation, financing apprenticeship (from employer-centric to balanced approach), standardisation of test and exams for on-the-job and off-the-job training for certification, awareness raising of apprenticeship opportunities.

The government of Pakistan (Ministry of Professional & Technical Training) formally initiated a comprehensive process to upgrade legislation (Act and Rules) for Apprenticeships in Pakistan. The new draft apprenticeship law has been finalized after technical consultations and has been submitted to the Government for review and further proceedings.

**Group Work: Ideal Apprenticeships Programme**
Participants were divided into three groups (by types of organisations: government, workers and employers). They were tasked to discuss on ‘what makes an ideal apprenticeship’: roles and responsibilities, policy and legislative framework, scope and coverage, financing, implementation and monitoring.

Below are some results from the group work.

**Trade union**

There should be social dialogue, legislation, minimum wage set, social protection, involvement in policy formulation, implementation review/monitoring for the apprenticeships.

Policy and legislative framework should include minimum standards, minimum wage and decent work.

Apprenticeship’s scope and coverage should be in specific sectors as per needs, and should cover the shortest possible period. Financing should be done by both employers and government.

Implementation and monitoring are to be carried out by the tripartite body and also the legal authority.

**Government**

Roles and responsibility comprise the legal framework, monitoring and coordination. Policy framework should be aligned to the national employment policies and plan/ it has to clearly identify lead agency/Ministry. In terms of legislative framework, there should be an autonomous committee for accreditation and certification. Key stakeholders should be bound by the laws.

The apprenticeship should be aligned to National Qualification Standards. Apprenticeship must be included in career counselling programme. Apprenticeship should reach out to all youths, be it in school, out of school, or both in rural and urban areas.

Financing apprenticeships should be both by government and private sector. Employers are to offer on the job training and government may do for off the job training. Multi-stakeholders monitoring must be included.

**Employer**

Employers should be opened for the opportunity and provide chances. Manpower planning is the responsibility of the employers, including identifying the skills gap. Employers should create encouraging environment for the apprentices. Code of conduct should be developed.

There should be evaluation system for evaluating the performance of apprentices. The role of government is to finance apprenticeship programme, monitoring and facilitation with the inspection (simplifying the procedures).
Media awareness is important. Specific targeted apprenticeship activities for the young people. In terms of financing, the government should be major contributor, employers and workers should also contribute (the latter is to ensure ownership).

Talk Show: Toward a Model Apprenticeship Programme

This session is video recorded to be uploaded on youtube and CoP. The session was in the form of fishbowl. The panel included Mr Tui Toutou from Fiji, Mr Ubaidur Usmani from Pakistan, and Mr Kimroeun Kouy from Cambodia. The session was moderated by Ms Del Irani.

Various questions were raised to the three panelists such as young people should be empowered and their voices should be heard. Participants agreed that apprenticeships are the best way to ensure easy transition from school to work. Apprenticeship programme should be relevant and updated. Apprenticeship is win-win solution as long as the right of employees are protected. How to transfer skills from the informal sector to formal sector was also questioned.

The young people should be involved in the whole process, starting from the designing of the programmes to the implementation and monitoring. Young people should be given more opportunity for apprenticeships.

After the Workshop, tripartite members should implement or come up with framework or regulations to implement what have been discussed during the Workshop.
Annexes:

Annex 1  Agenda
Annex 2  List of participants
Annex 3  Presentations and papers*

3.1 Background paper: Comparative Analysis of Quality Apprenticeships.
3.2 Presentation of the background paper
3.3 Presentation on How Interns Help? – An experience sharing Asia-Pacific Labour Market Updates by Mr Matthieu Cognac, ILO Specialist on Youth Employment
3.4.1 Asia-Pacific Labour Market Updates presentation
3.4.2 Asia-Pacific Labour Market Updates – Oct 2015 issue
3.4 Cambodia - Supporting Youth in School-to-Work Transition (NEA)
3.5 Cambodia - Apprenticeships in Cambodia (DG TVET)
3.6 The Apprenticeships Scheme in Germany
3.7 Quality Apprenticeships in Africa (paper)
3.8 Apprenticeship scheme in South America (Peru)
3.9 Apprenticeship in China (from China Enterprise Confederation)
3.10 Apprenticeship in Fiji
   3.12.1 Apprenticeship in Indonesia
   3.12.2 Internship Programme Implementation (Indonesia)
3.13 Apprenticeship System in Pakistan

*Presentation of the Cambodia young leader can be found at the following link (prezi):
https://prezi.com/ekiwxj7mchxe/quality-apprenticeships-and-work-experience